BH. SICHA CHUKAS VOL 18 -2 - Siyum Tractate Nidah

"People of Alexandria asked R' Yehoshua 3 "foolish" questions:

- 1. Does Lot's wife transmit impurity? (No)
- 2. Does the Shunamite's son transmit impurity? (No)
- 3. Will the resurrected require sprinkling? (We'll see then)

Transmittal of impurity has 2 requirements:

- A. A BODY
- B. FROM WHICH A SOUL HAS DEPARTED

In question 1: Is "A" (BODY) satisfied?

Analysis #1: What kind of miracle was it?

Transformative or Constant? (e.g.: Frogs or Blood)

Analysis #2: What causes impurity:

Soul leaving or resultant soulless body?

(e.g. Bris: Is Mitzvah act or result?)

Conclusion: Doesn't matter: There's no body

In question 2: Is "B" (DEPARTED SOUL) satisfied?

Analysis: Soul has left; another soul replaced it

Conclusion: Doesn't matter; Both body & soul are present

In question 3: Both A (BODY) & B (SOUL) are satisfied

Question is NOT whether they'll transmit impurity Rather whether THEY will be impure

Analysis: Resurrection is completely new body, or combination of old & new?