

ב. כפירה במעמד הר סיני היא היפך המדע

מכתב לשלמה קארליבאך אודות א' מתלמידיו – האוורד גאלדשטיין – שכפר במציאות הא-ל ומעמד הר סיני. ראה גם לקמן מכתב ד

25th of Iyar, 5712
Brooklyn 13, N.Y.

Rabbi S. Carlebach
305 W. 79th Street
New York, N.Y.

Sholom u'Brocho:

Recently you brought to my attention a letter addressed to you by Howard B. Goldstein, a student at Colgate University, Hamilton, New York. In this letter the writer professes to be a true scientific thinker and an unbeliever in the supernatural; he also asserts that 'all facts seem to be in contradiction to the existence of G-d,' professes to be a 'liberal Jew,' etc., etc.

Not knowing the background of this student, nor the field of science in which he specializes, I cannot deal with the subject in detail, especially in the course of a letter.

There are, however, several general observations that I can make, which the said student has apparently overlooked, and which he would do well to consider carefully:

(1) Science does not come with foregone conclusions and beliefs with the idea of reconciling and adjusting facts to these beliefs. Rather the opposite, it deals with facts then formulates opinions and conclusions. To approach a subject with one's mind made up beforehand, is not true scientific thinking but a contradiction to it.

(2) Science requires that no conclusion can be valid before a thorough study and research was made on the subject. The question therefore presents itself: How much time and effort had the abovementioned writer devoted to the study of religion to justify his conclusions on the subject?

(3) A fact is considered any event or phenomenon testified to by witnesses, especially where the evidence is identical and comes from witnesses of varied interests, education, social background, age, etc. Where there is such evidence it is accepted as a fact which is undeniable even if it does not agree with a scientific theory. This is the accepted practice in science even where there are several reliable witnesses, and certainly scores of them, hundreds and thousands.

The Divine Revelation at Mount Sinai was a fact witnessed by millions of people, all of whom reported it to its minutest detail accurately, for the whole people of Israel stood at Mount Sinai and witnessed it. We know that this is a fact, because millions of Jews in our day accept it as such, and they received it as such from their own parents, and these millions in turn received the evidence from the previous generation, and so on, in an uninterrupted chain of transmitted evidence from millions to millions of witnesses, generation after generation,

back to the original millions of witnesses who saw the event with their own eyes. Among these original witnesses there were many who were initiated in the sciences of those days (viz. Egypt), many achievements of which are still baffling nowadays; among them were philosophers and thinkers, as well as ignorant and uneducated persons, women and children of all ages. Yet all of them reported the event and phenomena connected with it without contradiction to each other.

Such a fact is certainly undisputable. I do not believe that there is another fact which ~~may~~ can match it for evidence and accuracy.

To deny such a fact is anything but scientific; it is the very opposite of science.

Parenthetically, it is unfortunate that this basic difference between the Jewish religion and those of others is so little known, for the Jewish religion is the only one that is not based on a single founder or a few, but is based on the Divine Revelation witnessed by all the people, numbering several millions.

This answers also Mr. Goldstein's statement that "the acceptance of the Torah as being the only truth is dangerous" since "it's (its) authors were only men... and as men they could not have been incorrigible (infallable)." Jews accept the Torah precisely because it was given by G-d, not by men, and it was given in the presence of millions of people who have seen it and heard it with their own eyes and ears. That is why the Torah is the absolute truth, for G-d is absolute.

I am enclosing an extra copy, should you wish to forward it to your correspondent.

With all good wishes,

Cordially